

1 APPROVED
2 HDC MEETING
3 MARCH 1, 2018
4

5 Board Members Present: Chair Rodney Rowland, Vice Chair Jeff Hughes, Tom Maher, Elaine
6 Nollet, Irene Bush, Peter Reed and Judy Groppa
7

8 Not Present: Kate Murray
9

10 Chair Rowland called the meeting of the New Castle HDC to order at 7:00 pm and advised that
11 there is one hearing on the agenda tonight. He also advised that anyone wishing to speak, must
12 please sign in. The Chair, Jeff Hughes, Tom Maher, Judy Groppa, and Peter Reed will be
13 voting.
14

15 1. Hearing for Marilyn Walker, 32 Walbach Street, Map 18, Lot 57
16

17 Guests: Wendy Welton, Architect; Josh Thorp from Pella Windows; Marilyn Walker, Applicant;
18 Leonard Seagren, Doug Palardy, and Dan Innis, Abutters.
19

20 Chair Rowland advised that the application was publicized, all fees had been paid and all
21 abutters had been notified.
22

23 Architect Wendy Welton stated the building plans had not changed a whole lot from the work
24 session the previous month. The new plans show the chimney has been centered and also shows
25 a chimney cap as well as the existing stone wall and grading. If, after the grading is complete,
26 there is too much foundation visible, they will come back before the commission for approval of
27 brick on the foundation. However, the current plan is to bring the grade up and not have a lot of
28 concrete visible on the foundation.
29

30 Peter Reed stated that the shrubs on the water side go up about 15' or 20' and asked if Welton
31 was reducing the size of the retaining wall. They are not changing the retaining wall although it
32 may look shorter on the plans and she also noted that the shrubs are shown smaller on the plans
33 so you can see the house design.
34

35 Josh Thorp presented the Pella window Architect Series Reserve line adding that Strawberry
36 Banke has used the sashes on one of their buildings, although the museum used wood windows.
37 Pella has released this window while working in conjunction with the National Parks committee
38 and historical districts throughout the nation. The exterior of the Architect series is aluminum
39 clad to get the putty glazed look with the grills and they added foam spacers between the glass to
40 make it look more like a true divided light. One of the things that the National Park Association
41 pointed out to Pella in the design of this window is equal sight lines and Thorp pointed out that
42 your sight is not interrupted while looking through the window so that the top sash and bottom
43 sash checkrail meet. Pella really tried to check all the boxes when it came to this historic
44 window and the through style construction and the butt joints emulate the historic details. The
45 window is six over six, double pane insulating glass, comes with either a full or half screen and
46 has a tilt feature which is hidden in the sash. This window is a true wood window on the

1 interior. Judy Groppa stated the window seemed to have a deep setback and asked if this was
2 because of the screen; Thorp advised that the depth is purely for the top sash to move up and
3 down and Welton stated it is due to the modern requirements for double glazing, while single
4 pane sashes were thinner, this has to meet modern day energy codes. Groppa said that she finds
5 it a very deep box and thought it would create a lot of shadow and not what you would find in an
6 1800's house. Tom Maher stated that the actual window would be a larger scale and the sash
7 may appear smaller in a full scale window rather than in the small sample before the
8 commission. Wendy Welton said most houses have at least a half screen and when you consider
9 the actual window will be larger and with the distance from the road, she didn't think it would be
10 noticeable and not much different from other brands available in historic district appropriate
11 windows.

12
13 Chair Rowland stated that Strawberry Banke used these windows in Mambo Restaurant in the
14 Dunaway house, but Josh Thorp stated that this series evolved from the windows used at
15 Dunaway House, adding that they have deepened the depth on the putty glazing as well as the
16 through style construction through the sash and the butt joinery. Rowland stated the ones they
17 used in the Dunaway House matched wonderfully with the originals.

18
19 Thorp stated that Pella's entry door line works with Thermatru and he displayed the panels
20 Thermatru provides in both fiberglass panels and mahogany panels. Welton advised the
21 proposed door is a fiberglass panel with mahogany grain. Chair Rowland confirmed the Walkers
22 have chosen a traditional six panel door and Thorp stated the architect series entry door is a little
23 wider and more ornate and the graining is nicer and tighter, especially with the mahogany grain
24 door. It is a paintable door and Pella will either factory stain it or paint it. Groppa asked if he
25 had an example of the smooth version as she thinks it is very fake looking. Thorp did not have a
26 sample of the smooth but felt the graining would match better adding that the sample is not as
27 tight as on the actual door.

28
29 The French door is in Pella's reserved line and will have the same architectural detail as the
30 window presented. The French door will be on the water side of the house off of the deck. Chair
31 Rowland confirmed that the door and window schedule in the plans is accurate and that the fiber
32 classic mahogany collection is also accurate.

33
34 The Chair made corrections to his set of plans and also took specs presented at the meeting to
35 submit with the application, confirming that the windows will be Pella not Marvin as indicated in
36 the submission. All windows will be six over six except for the side windows on the bay
37 window. Jeff Hughes asked if everything else on the window schedule was correct, such as
38 white Azek PVC trim, etc. Welton stated Yes and the sash type will be double hung, not tilt and
39 turn. Welton added that the Site plan has not changed and they are keeping the existing curb cut
40 and retaining wall and intend to keep the perimeter shrubs.

41
42 At the work session, the first floor plan reflected a platform with iron railings on the front door,
43 which will not be needed because they are bringing up the gradings. The house will have just a
44 simple granite step. There will be exterior mechanical apparatus such as AC condenser and
45 propane tank, but the location may change a little if the electrician or plumber deem it necessary.

46

1 The front elevation and right elevation shows the garage door and there is a picture of the
2 proposed door in the packet. Details for the door surround is a solid material like Azek. The
3 rear elevation and water side elevation show the deck and French doors with the transom which
4 would be the same window. There is also included details for the door surround, pylons &
5 window schedule for all windows in the house.
6

7 Welton brought a sample of the smooth siding that will be used. It is a fiber cement siding which
8 is generally done tucked in at the corners, however it is possible to install it with butt joints, but
9 this is the preferred method on fiber cement. Chair Rowland asked what the reveal is on the
10 clapboards. Welton stated she has 5 1/2" shown but they can go smaller if the commission
11 prefers. A typical colonial is 4" claps and butt joints are a classic detail. Hughes asked if the
12 siding was Hardie board and whether they would be open to installing 4" claps. It was agreed to
13 use butt joints instead of corner boards and install 4" claps.
14

15 Welton passed around brick samples and deck samples and presented a proposed deck rail,
16 adding that they are using low maintenance material with a little bit of grain so it is not as
17 slippery. It is sturdy and will stay good looking for a long time and it is paintable. Irene asked if
18 the plans accurately depicted the size of the newels and ballisters. The door surround is also s
19 solid material like Azek.
20

21 Groppa asked if the brick was in sheets. Welton said it will be thin brick but looks like full depth
22 brick and is individually applied and mortared. Jeff Hughes asked her to describe the garage
23 door. It is a fiberglass door that will be painted white and opens up, bending in three sections. It
24 is synthetic, insulated, and durable as opposed to wood which requires so much maintenance.
25

26 Chair Rowland confirmed that the applicant agreed on 4" reveal on the clapboard and he also
27 recommended traditional butt joints. Irene Bush asked if there had been discussion about the bay
28 window at the work session and the Chair advised there was not much discussion because it is in
29 an inconspicuous spot.
30

31 Peter Reed asked about the height of the building and whether it is the same as the building that
32 is there now? Welton stated the existing house's ridge is 45'2" and the new house will be 51'5".
33 The grading showing now is not different than what is presently there.
34

35 Hughes advised Reed that the commission spoke about the height of the house at the work
36 session and the board is comfortable with it and that the increased height was required for the
37 interior elevator. Chair Rowland confirmed the grade will be brought up and have no more than
38 a 12" reveal. Welton stated they will do so as best they can but on the garage the wood must be
39 at least 6" from dirt, so 12" is probably what it will end up with some grading and then they will
40 bring mulch in. There is ledge at the corner of the garage so they may have to bring the stem
41 wall of the garage up and put a shrub there.
42

43 Irene asked about the deck on the Walbach side. Chair Rowland said at least this is not a 2nd
44 floor deck and first floor decks are all over the district. Welton stated the new placement of the
45 house conforms with town setbacks as the old house did not conform to setbacks. The result is
46 that there is not much outdoor space so the deck is important. Chair Rowland stated the deck is

1 off grade and shows support posts and asked if they were doing any enclosure under the deck.
2 Welton said they are open to screening it but that makes it difficult to clean underneath. Chair
3 Rowland said he would like to see what will be used under the deck for screening because the
4 commission cannot depend on shrubs. Welton suggested adding a stipulation that they come
5 back before the commission with proposed screening, or a privacy fence with a door underneath,
6 and that was agreed to. Rowland also asked if they had filled out a request for public hearing
7 form as he could not find one in the packet and he must sign this document for approval. The
8 Chair advised them to go the town website and complete the new application and get it to the
9 town office on Friday morning.

10
11 Chair Rowland asked if there were any other questions from the board and there being none, he
12 opened the meeting to the public at 7:49 pm

13
14 Leonard Seagren of 95 Walbach St. stated it is the first time he has seen the plans for this
15 property and it looks like the garage faces his house. He asked if the driveway was going to be
16 between the garage and his house? Rowland stated the driveway is not being moved. It was
17 confirmed that the garage faces the Seagren house and that entry into the garage is on the side by
18 his house. Seagren stated he liked the window arrangement, however he did not think the
19 chimney on the outside of the house was appropriate and makes the house look like a 1950's
20 version of a colonial house and also believes the chimney should be on the front of the house.
21 The house is being re-arranged on the lot by 90° and the external chimney is bothersome but he
22 also knows that it takes room from inside of the house. In his opinion, the front of the house is
23 the wrong way.

24
25 Doug Palardy and Dan Innis of 33 Walbach Street, directly across the street from applicant's
26 property as well as owners of the Great Island Inn on Walbach Street wrote a letter which is on
27 file, adding that they are supportive of the demolition and redo of the house but have some
28 concerns. They agree with Leonard Seagren's opinion about the exterior chimney as their house
29 faces the side with the chimney. They are also concerned about the height of the house although
30 Palardy thought the house was going to be 10' higher than the present house but Chair Rowland
31 advised that it is actually only 6" higher in ridge height.

32
33 Dan Innis stated there are some things that just "bother the eye". The back which faces the
34 Borden house is sparse on windows and doesn't have any character. He believes it will be seen
35 from the street because of its height and position, doesn't believe it has a historic look and feel,
36 and hopes this can be corrected because it doesn't fit the character of a walk around the block.
37 The front looks nice and the configuration on the lot is fine and overall the house will be an
38 improvement over the existing property.

39
40 Palardy stated their last concern is the materials being proposed stating that their house is
41 completely wood as are the neighbors' houses and he doesn't feel there is any wood on the
42 outside of this house. The design, especially the front, is fine but everything in the district is
43 wood and there is no use of natural materials here. He also likes the idea of traditional butt joints
44 on the clapboard much better than what Welton proposed. Palardy also stated he hopes the
45 landscaping remains the way it is but this is an issue for the Planning Board, not the HDC.

1 Chair Rowland closed the public session at 7:57 pm and put the matter before the board for
2 discussion. To respond to some concerns of Seagren, Innis & Palardy, he advised that the house
3 orientation came about because the Walkers wanted to make it more conforming to setbacks
4 which they have done. It is still a proper colonial on both sides which face the street. Welton
5 added that they felt compelled to face the door on the Walbach Street side as that is where people
6 come up to the house and the cut through in the retaining wall is also where the steps are, which
7 makes sense.

8
9 The Chair said he understands the materials are not traditional, but today you can't get wood that
10 is slow grown and it's very difficult to get quality materials. There is also the maintenance
11 consideration and he recognizes that simulated products have come a long way and the board
12 had been approving them in the historic district for at least a decade. He said it will be interesting
13 to see what will be the first house with nontraditional materials go up in the district. With
14 regard to the chimney location, the house is on a corner lot so it has to go somewhere. The
15 owners were clear about their need for living space and where they wanted to put it, adding that
16 he will concede its location but would like the board's opinion. Irene Bush asked if they could
17 put it on the back side of the house but Welton stated it is a wood burning fireplace and the way
18 the house is laid out, they really cannot move the kitchen to put the chimney in the back of the
19 house. The placement of the chimney had been discussed at the work session and ultimately the
20 commission went along with its placement on the side.

21
22 Jeff Hughes stated he wanted to go back to Doug Palardy's point about the back side of the
23 house and the lack of windows and asked if there was a possibility of adding windows? Welton
24 stated that because Walbach Street is so low, and with the retaining wall, the back of the house
25 was really not going to be seen. Hughes stated that the front looks like a colonial but the back
26 looks like a colonial in a new development. Wendy stated that after the garage, the kitchen
27 begins and the counters do not allow for larger windows. Hughes thought the level of the garage
28 door was off and looks like it is below grade. Welton stated the stem wall of the garage
29 generally comes up for water coming off the car and that one will step down from the house or
30 the garage.

31
32 After much discussion about the size of windows and adding windows to the back of the house,
33 it was decided to add one window on the back which will match the height of the kitchen
34 window and add another window on the garage, and to move the garage person-door over to
35 balance everything.

36
37 Chair Rowland asked Welton to swap the plan sheet out showing the changes of adding the
38 window on the back of the house and on the garage when she brings the completed public
39 hearing application in to the town clerk's office, which she agreed to do. Peter Reed asked if
40 there had been discussion about outdoor lighting? Chair Rowland said the board typically does
41 not review lighting, however Welton stated they will have proposed lighting when they come
42 back before the commission with their proposal for the privacy screen under the deck.

43
44 Jeff Hughes motioned to approve the application w/the following changes:
45 Landscaping around the home to be brought up to no less than a 12" reveal on the foundation;
46 Windows will be 6 over 6 Pella Architect Series Reserve line;

1 Doors will be Thermatru mahogany series;
2 The clapboard will have a 4” reveal with a smooth finish and traditional butt joints;
3 School house old brick originals will be used on the chimney;
4 Add two windows to the rear elevation and relocate the garage person door.
5 The Walkers will come back before the board for apron screening around the decking and for
6 outdoor lighting.

7
8 Tom Maher seconded; All members were in favor including the Chair.

9
10 Chair Rowland stated he will contact Pam Cullen about the application.

11
12 2. Minutes of February 1, 2018

13
14 Jeff Hughes motioned to approve the minutes of February 1, 2018 as amended; Judy Groppa
15 seconded. All approved.

16
17 3. New Business

18
19 Chair Rowland said that he touched base with the Division of Historical Resources and the CLG
20 application has now been approved by the State and has been submitted to the National Park
21 Service for their review.

22
23 Tom Maher motioned to adjourn; Jeff Hughes seconded. Meeting adjourned at 8:23 pm

24
25 Respectfully submitted,
26 Diane L. Cooley, Recording Secretary

27